Philosophy 200: Extracto Presentation

By Eliot Dix

Author Argument

From American progress.org

"The Open Letter recognizes that in a pluralistic society, the government cannot privilege the teachings of one religion over another. No single religious voice can speak for all faith traditions on abortion, nor should the government take sides on religious differences. More than 40 religious denominations and organizations support the right to safe and legal abortion. It is unconscionable to legislate specific religious doctrine concerning abortion for all Americans or for the women of the world."

(Obtained via https://www.americanprogress.org/article/abortion-as-a-moral-decision/)

Argument Extraction

- 1. We live in a pluralistic society.
- 2. If we live in a pluralistic society, then the government cannot privilege the teachings of one religion over another.
- 3. If the government cannot privilege the teachings of one religion over another, then the government must consider the 40 religions that support safe and legal abortion,
- 4. If the government must consider the 40 religions that support safe and legal abotions, then it is unconscionable to legislate based on specific religious doctrine concerning abortion.
- 5. Therefore, it is unconscionable to legislate based on specific religious doctrine concerning abortion.

Explanation

- 1. We live in a pluralistic society.
- 2. If we live in a pluralistic society, then the government cannot privilege the teachings of one religion over another.
- 3. If the government cannot privilege the teachings of one religion over another, then the government must consider the 40 religions that support safe and legal abortion,
- 4. If the government must consider the 40 religions that support safe and legal abotions, then it is unconscionable to legislate based on specific religious doctrine concerning abortion.
- 5. Therefore, it is unconscionable to legislate based on specific religious doctrine concerning abortion.

Evaluation



This argument is valid and sound...BUT

Objection: Premise 2: "If we live in a pluralistic society, then the government cannot privilege the teachings of one religion over another."